

Notice of Allowability

Application No.

09/775,025

Examiner

Taylor Victor Oh

Applicant(s)

ROSEN, BRUCE I.

Art Unit

1625

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to 12/30/2003.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-16 and 18-20.
3. ☒ The drawings filed on 30 December 2003 are accepted by the Examiner.
4. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 - a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some* c) ☐ None of the:
 1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
- * Certified copies not received: _____.
5. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).
 - (a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
6. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application. **THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.**

7. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
8. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS must be submitted.
 - (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
 - 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No. _____.
 - (b) ☐ including changes required by the proposed drawing correction filed _____, which has been approved by the Examiner.
 - (c) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No. _____.

Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the top margin (not the back) of each sheet. The drawings should be filed as a separate paper with a transmittal letter addressed to the Official Draftsperson.

9. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 2 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 3 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 4 <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413), Paper No. _____ |
| 5 <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statements (PTO-1449), Paper No. _____ | 6 <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Amendment/Comment |
| 7 <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit of Biological Material | 8 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance |
| | 9 <input type="checkbox"/> Other |

Allowance

1. The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

The close reference for the current invention are Sikkenga et al (U.S. 5,256,817) and Partenheimer et al (U.S. 5,081,290).

Sikkenga et al teaches a method of purifying a naphthalenedicarboxylic acid such as 2,6-naphthalenedicarboxylic acid obtained from the oxidation of 2,6-dimethylnaphthalene by treating the impure naphthalenedicarboxylic acid with hydrogen in the presence of a hydrogenation catalyst and a mixture of carboxylic acid and water at a temperature of at least 500⁰ F. Partenheimer et al describes a process of producing an aromatic dicarboxylic acid by the oxidation of a polyalkyl aromatic compound such as 2,6-naphthalenedicarboxylic acid obtained from the oxidation of 2,6-dimethylnaphthalene in the presence of a catalyst system containing tin.

However, the instant invention differs from the references in that there is no suggestion that the bi-metal catalyst containing Group VIII and Group IVB metals would be used in the presence of hydrogen during the claimed purification process since the Partenheimer et al's tin catalyst has only used in the oxidation process, thereby lacking in a reasonable success and motivation; furthermore, according to the filed declaration dated on 6/10/2003, applicants have shown unexpected results such as the improved reduction of impurities of 6-Me-2NA and 2,6-DCT at the claimed temperature range of 520-575⁰ F.

Therefore, applicants' claimed subject matter would not have been obvious to the person with an ordinary skill in the art.

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

Any inquiry concerning the communication after allowance such as sending all post-allowance correspondence should be directed to "Box Issue Fee" or faxed directly to PUBS at 703-305-8755. This will expedite the process of these papers.

gh
1/23/04

D. Margaret Seaman
D. MARGARET SEAMAN
PRIMARY EXAMINER